

# South West Devon Waste Partnership

Thursday 16 July 2009

## PRESENT:

Councillor Michael Leaves, in the Chair (minute numbers 1 – 3)  
Councillor Croad, in the Chair (minute numbers 4 – 12)  
Councillor Butt, Vice Chair.  
Councillors Bowyer and Hart.

Observer members: Councillors Brazil, Doggett and Gordon

Apologies for absence: Councillors Carroll and Brazil

The meeting started at 11.00 am and finished at 12.30 pm.

*Note: At a future meeting, the committee will consider the accuracy of these draft minutes, so they may be subject to change. Please check the minutes of that meeting to confirm whether these minutes have been amended.*

## 1. INTRODUCTIONS AND APOLOGIES

Councillor Michael Leaves welcomed members to the meeting.

## 2. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

There were no declarations of interest.

## 3. APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

Resolved that in accordance with the Joint Working Agreement Schedule C clause 4 –

- (1) Councillor Roger Croad be appointed as Chair until the first meeting of the Joint Committee after the 1<sup>st</sup> May 2010;
- (2) Councillor Dave Butt be appointed as Vice-Chair until the first meeting of the Joint Committee after the 1<sup>st</sup> May 2010.

## 4. MINUTES

Resolved that the minutes of the meeting of the South West Devon Waste Partnership Joint Committee held on Wednesday 14 January 2009 are confirmed as a correct record.

## 5. PROJECT UPDATE

The Partnership received an update from Mark Turner, Project Director on the progress of the project so far and members were informed that –

- (i) since the last meeting of the Partnership the procurement process had moved on considerably, the market had been Invited to Submit Outline Solutions (ISOS), the outline solutions had been received, evaluated and participants (bidders) short listed;
- (ii) the ISOS stage had now reached a conclusion and the results would be presented to the Committee as part of Exempt Business prior to formal notification to participants and information release to the public;

- (iii) investigation and negotiations had continued with a potential user of heat from the potential solution;
- (iv) there had been a number of public engagements with the community and in particular with a group called STIFLE (Stop the Incinerator Fouling Land at Ernesettle) who were opposed to the possible site at Ernesettle. There are also public roadshows being planned for the coming months.

## 6. EVALUATION PROCESS USED TO REVIEW AND SHORTLIST OUTLINE SOLUTIONS

The Partnership received a summary presentation from Martin Pollard, Project Manager on the agreed evaluation criteria and the process used to rank the outline solutions submitted by bidders and members were informed that –

- (i) the Invitation to Submit Outline Solutions (ISOS) bid evaluation procedure was approved by the Partnership Committee on 14 January 2009;
- (ii) it was agreed that three participants would be shortlisted with the option to shortlist a fourth;
- (iii) there had been nine solutions submitted; these were all checked in line with the initial evaluation criteria tests for completeness, affordability, if they contained a thermal element and the biodegradable municipal waste percentage going to landfill;
- (iv) all bids that had been submitted passed the initial evaluation criteria tests;
- (v) each outline solution submitted was then formally evaluated by the Partnership project team against the agreed detailed ISOS evaluation criteria and given a quality score which then formulated the final score which also considered gate fee (price);
- (vi) the process was witnessed and fully audited by a member of the Devon Audit Partnership who had confirmed that the process had been robustly followed and the final score of each solution was valid.

## 7. ANY OTHER BUSINESS

There were no items of any other business.

## 8. DATE AND LOCATION OF NEXT MEETING

Resolved that the next meeting will be held at 11am on Thursday 5 November 2009 at County Hall, Devon County Council, Exeter.

## 9. EXEMPT BUSINESS

Resolved that, under Section 100(A)(4) of the Local Government Act, 1972, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involves the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Act, as amended by the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

10. **RESULTS OF EVALUATION OF OUTLINE SOLUTIONS AND THE SHORT LISTED BIDDERS**

Mark Turner, Project Director and Martin Pollard, Project Manager presented a summary of the results from the evaluation process and the bidders' short listed to proceed to the detailed solution stage and members were informed that –

- (i) all bidders submitted a solution that included Ernesettle as its site, with three participants also submitting a variant bid on an alternative site;
- (ii) the three participants with the highest scoring solutions were MVV Umwelt, SITA UK and Viridor and they would be invited to take forward 5 solutions in total;
- (iii) a fourth participant could also be invited.

Resolved that –

- (1) three bidders proposing five solutions would be taken forward to the Invitation to Submit Detailed Solutions (ISDS) stage of the procurement process. The participants being MVV Umwelt, SITA UK and Viridor;
- (2) there would be a press release informing the public which bidders' would be going forward to the ISDS stage.

11. **SUMMARY OF OUTLINE SOLUTIONS SUBMITTED BY BIDDERS**

Mark Turner, Project Director and Martin Pollard, Project Manager presented a summary of the outline solutions proposed by each of the short listed bidders' and members were informed that –

- (i) the Ernesettle site was the reference case site in the outline business case but that the Partnership was open to other site options;
- (ii) MVV Umwelt and SITA UK had each submitted an energy from waste solution located at the Ernesettle site;
- (iii) MVV Umwelt and SITA UK had also each submitted a variant solution proposing an energy from waste facility located on sites within HM Naval Base Devonport;
- (iv) Viridor had submitted an energy from waste solution located on the New England Quarry site at Lee Mill; a site that is owned by Viridor.

12. **APPROVAL OF SPECIFIC EVALUATION CRITERIA AND METHODOLOGY FOR JUDGING BIDDERS RESPONSES TO THE INVITATION TO SUBMIT DETAILED SOLUTIONS (ISDS) FIRST STAGE**

Mark Turner, Project Director and Martin Pollard, Project Manager introduced the report on 'approval of specific evaluation criteria and methodology for judging bidders' responses to the Invitation to Submit Detailed Solutions' First Stage'. In addition to the detailed overview of the report the partnership was informed that –

- (i) this report was in accordance with the SWDWP Joint Working Agreement, in that it required members to understand, influence and agree all criteria that was to be used to assess and evaluate detailed solutions;
- (ii) the scoring weightings had been amended to make the detailed solutions submitted relevant and viable to the ISDS stage.

Resolved that –

- (1) the evaluation procedure, criteria and scoring methodology as set out in the report is approved;
- (2) the finalisation of the Bid Evaluation Procedure document (annexed to the report) is delegated to the South West Devon Waste Partnership Project Executive.